AN HON. MEMBERS: The negotiations are over now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please let him finish. Mr. Gopalsamy, don't get agitated. Let him finish. Please sit down. The Minister is going to give the viewpoint of the Government. If you do not want to hear, I will ask him not to speak. If you want him to commit, then let him say something.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Mr. Gopalsamy thinks that I am JVP here. I am not. He is attacking me but I cannot...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Your Prime Minister is totally confused and you have bungled in this matter.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I will convey the views expressed by the hon. Members of the House immediately to the Minister of External Affairs and I will come back to the House. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, is it a postman's duty?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will also discuss the matter with the Chairman and see how we can accommodate it. I am giving my assurance.

Agitation by School Teachers

SHRI ASHOK NATH VERMA (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, more than 37 lakh teachers working in more than 8 lakh schools all over the country have decided to intensify their agitation and from the middle of November next they have decided to go on hunger strike. Representatives of the teachers were on dharna at the Boat Club and they have ended it only a few days back. Teachers are agitating for the implementation of the recommendations of the Chattopadhyaya Committee Report which was appointed by the Government in 1983. The Committee submitted its report in 1986, but so far the Government has not taken any decision on its recommendations. Last year in November there was a rally by the teachers at the Boat Club and the Government had given them an assurance that their just and reasonable demands will be conceded.

I, therefore, request the Government to look into the matter and take steps to implement the recommendations of Chattopadyaya Commission immediately and see that the teachers are not driven to hunger strike and agitations which will be harmful to the studies and the future carrer of crores of children all over the country.

REFERENCE TO THE INDEPENDENCE DAY SPEECH BY THE PRIME MINISETR

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): I am on a point of order. When we as Members of this House come and assume the duties as Members of this House, we take an oath, and that is the oath to the Constitution of this country; that is the oath to the.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is this point of order about? I am still with the special mentions. Let me finish it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is a very important matter... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If your point of order arises out of this special mention, you can raise it; otherwise I am not allowing you to raise your point of order. When the time comes, you can raise.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You tell me when the time will come.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know. It was Mr. Ashok Nath Verma's special mention.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): He cannot refer about traitors in the House... (*Interruptions*)... It is a very serious matter. The Prime Minister stated from the ramparts of Red Fort that there were traitors in the House. We are entitled to know who the traitors are. Let the Prime Minister come and tell us... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is not an ordinary person who is saying this; it is the Prime Minister of the country.....

SHRI DIPEN KHOSH: It is against the Members of this House; it is a serious matter.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: And if this allegation is correct... (*Interruptions*)...an explanation is needed as to who the traitors are.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh): Madam, it was a very special occasion, a very auspicious occasion for the whole nation, and to make such a slanderous remark from the ramparts of the Red Fort is something shocking; the whole nation has been shocked. Therefore, we would like to understand it. We are Members of this House. For the last 40 years, no Prime Minister has made remarks of this kind from the ramparts of Red Fort on Independence Day that 'today traitors have reached even the Parliament House'. After all, in the party and thrust of political debate I can take the criticism; I can ignore some times as even abuses me. But if he uses the word "traitor", I would regret it as the worst abuse that can be hurled at me. I do not know whether I am among those whom he referred as traitors to say; 'traitors have reached the House'. I really do not know...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have heard everybody. I heard what your feelings are, and I am sure that will be conveyed to the Government —whatever you have said.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is a question where the privilege of the House is involved... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you feel that it is a matter of privilege, kindly give a privilege notice.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is a matter of privilege of the House; the Prime Minister makes such a statement outside the House.... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, no privilege. We will deal with him politically. (*Interruptions*). But is this the way to speak? He says 'Traitors are roaming in Parliament'. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request hon. Members to take their seats and let us go on with our regular Business. Whatever you wanted to say, you have said. (*Interruptions*) I cannot give a ruling on it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam, please convey to the Prime Minister. I would request you. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let it be decided first, who is the traitor? I am the last person... (*Interruptions*) to be with traitors. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam, you are also the custodian of the dignity of the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): Madam, I am on a point of order. Please allow my point of order. (*Interruptions*) I have raised a point of order. (*Interruptions*) Please allow me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed him. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Afterwards, please allow me.
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANSAMY (Pondichery): The Prime Minister said that anti-national forces... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Those who have sold the interests of the country to the Bofors are the traitors. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Madam, we should know, who is the traitor in the House. (*Interruptions*) The Prime Minister should tell us, who is the traitor in the House. (*Interruptions*) Otherwise, he has to apologise. He should tender an unqualified apology to the House. (*Interruptions*) He has misused the Red Fort. He has misused the Independence Day. He has attacked the Opposition... (*Interruptions*)... as traitors. (*Interruptions*) He spoke as a partyman there. He never spoke as the Prime Minister of India. (*Interruptions*)

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): The Prime Minister did not utter the word 'traitors'. (*Interruptions*) He referred to certain elements. Why are you getting upset? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Does the Prime Minister think that he is the only patriot left in this country? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: He did talk about certain elements. (*Interruptions*) Why is it sticking to them? (*Interruptions*) He did not refer to the whole Opposition. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The Prime Minister has destroyed the Independence Day. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: He did not refer to everybody. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He has misused the Red Fort. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Madam, Mr. Ram Jethmalani is definitely an anti-national. (*Interruptions*) He is a traitor. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Jethmalani, sitting with you, is the traitor. (*Interruptions*). Mr. Jethmalani is definitely anti-national. He has played a role in the anti-national activities.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT IN THE MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE (SHRI JANARDHAN POOJARI): Mr. Jethmalai is the traitor, I say it (*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: You are the traitor.

SHRI JANARDHAN POOJARI: Mr. Jethmalani is the traitor, I say. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: He did refer to certain elements. Why are you agitated? He did not refer to the entire opposition. I do not know why you are agitated.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Mr. Ram Jethmalani is sitting there among the opposition Members. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whatever you wanted to say, you have said. Now let the Business of the House go on.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is a very serious matter. He has cast aspersions on the entire opposition. (*Interruptions*). Either the Prime Minister had somebody in his mind or he has used these words deliberately to malign the opposition.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Why are you unnecessarily agitated? He did not refer to the entire opposition, I repeat it. If he had referred to certain elements, those who are agitating unecessarily, it appears, the remark is sticking to them. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Will you agree that I am entitled to know who the traitor is?

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: That you yourself know. That is sufficient. (*Interruptions*). Every one of you knows about it.

SHRI JANARDHAN POOJARI: He is a traitor.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Mr. Ram Jethmalani has definitely pleaded the cause of Khalistan...He is sitting with the Janata Dal...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't get agitated.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am a sober man otherwise. But I am agitated over this. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: You do not know anything. You support Mr. Jethmalani. Definitely that is an anti-national attitude. He has played an anti-sational role. You are defending that anti-national role...That is totally wrong. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHRY (Andhra Pradesh): Every Indian on the street...who are traitors?...I seek your protection...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What the Prime Minister did yesterday is shameful. (*Interruptions*) No democratic country in the world can permit such a speech from a Prime Minister.

SHRI PARATHANENI UPENDRA: The Prime Minister obviously...

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI BUTA SINGH): Madam Deputy Chairman.... (*Interruptions*)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : (बिहार) : बाजपेयी जी सदन में आकर माफी मांगें ... (व्यवधान) ... देश के साथ गद्दारी करने वाले को... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA Madam, I just want to say...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Home Minister wants to say something. Let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, the Prime Minister has committed the greatest indiscretion by using his Independence Day speech to deride the entire Opposition. All those who heard the speech yesterday were shocked by the cheapness of that speech. If the Prime Minister has got somebody in view, whether it is Mr. Jethmalani or somebody else and if the Prime Minister or the Home Minister has got the evidence, let them prosecute him. Why not prosecute him? Let them prosecute him. He cannot deride the whole Opposition as anti-national. If the Prime Minister or the Home Minister has got the evidence, let them prosecute him. ...(*Interruptions*)...
You cannot go by a one-man standard. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request honourable Members to please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please listen to me. Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... I tell you, please sit down. Just a minute please sit down. The Government has a right to send anybody to reply The Home Minister will speak...(*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: No. The Prime Minister should come here and apologize. ...(*Interruptions*)... The Prime Minister should come to the House...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman... ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PUTTAPAGA RADHAKRISHNA (Andhra Pradesh): We want the Prime Minister to come here and explain. We don't want Mr. Buta Singh

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, the nation is grateful... ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request honourable Members to maintain some peace in the House.

SHRI PUTTAPAGA RADHAKRISHNA: We do not want the speech of Mr. Buta Singh.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request you, please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... I said, please. When I am on my legs, please sit down.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : मुल्क के स्वतंत्रता सेनानियों के खिलाफ गवाही दे कर उनको सजा दिलाने वाले को ...(व्यवधान) ... माफी मांगनी चाहिए । (व्यवधान)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I want to know whether he is officiating for the Prime Minister. ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: How can...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot defy the Chair. Please sit down. Until and unless you sit down, I won't allow anything.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I have got ....(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. If you don't sit down, I will not allow anybody to make any statement.

SHRI PUTTAPAGA RADHAKRISHNA: We are also not going to allow anybody.....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is not a simple matter. Let the Prime Minister come and explain. ...(*Interruptions*)... The Prime Minister has derided the entire Opposition. He has insulted Parliament. He has insulted democracy itself. He has misused the Red Fort. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't record.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:*

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala):*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:*

SHRI YASWANT SINHA:*

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, the nation is grateful to the hon. Prime Minister.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:*

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, may I for a change express appreciation for the leaders of the Opposition who have come to this august House realising the importance of the subject. The subject is really very serious. I want to highlight it. The House has a right to discuss it. (*Interruptions*)

Madam Deputy Chairman, I must say, for a change, that I want to appreciate the sentiments expressed by the hon. leaders of the Opposition. It is really very serious. It concerns the very unity and integrity of the country. (*Interruptions*)

Madam Deputy Chairman, I wish to place on record... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen. Let him make his point.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: At least some of them know it. (*Interruptions*) The matter is very serious. Therefore, I want to go on record. I would like to say that the whole nation feels grateful to the hon. Prime Minister because he has exposed the forces which are out to destabilise this country, the elements which are out to harm this country. The matter is very serious. The Government is willing to place before this august House the facts. (*Interruptions*) The Prime Minister has exposed the forces which want to sabotage democracy. We want

*Not recorded.

[Shri Buta Singh]

to discuss the matter fully. I want to make a statement on sabotage by divisive forces. I want your permission. Let this subject be discussed in the House. Let everybody come with facts. I will prove that every word that the Prime Minister has said from the Red Fort is correct. I will prove on record that everything that the Prime Minister has said is borne out by facts. Let this House discuss it here and now. I want to have a discussion.

THE DEPUTY CHIRMAN: Please go back to your seats.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman, it is a serious matter after what Mr. Home Minister has stated. He has stated that whatever Mr. Prime Minister had said yesterday from the rampart of the Red Fort is borne out by facts. He has said that he can prove what Mr. Prime Minister has stated is borne out by facts. We have heard what the Prime Minister had stated. We had heard him saying that the traitors have sneaked into Parliament; they have sneaked into this House; they have entered into this House. We are entitled to know all this. We are the elected Members. We are second to none to protect freedom, unity and integrity of the country. So, we cannot share this House with any traitor if there be any. So, we are entitled to know who the traitor is. So, let the normal discussion which we are taking up now be adjourned and let the Home Minister and the Prime Minister come out with whatever facts they have got in their possession and let us discuss it.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I am happy Shri Dipen Ghosh has come out. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, one Member of the Opposition has been heard properly, let the Home Minister react to it. (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. You have made your point on the Statement of the Home Minister. Let the Government react to it. And if they want to have a discussion, the Chair would not have any objection.

SHRI M S. GURUPADASWAMY: We would like to have a thorough discussion on it. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHIARMAN: Mr. Balaram, if you really feel it is a serious matter, then be patient and discuss it properly. (*Interruptions*) Please, one minute. Just a second.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: Let him place all the facts. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a second. If the Members feel that it is a very serious matter and the Home Minister has reacted and Members from the Opposition entirely are agreeable that there should be a discussion, let the Parliamentary Affairs Minister come forward... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): But where is the Prime Minister?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The Prime Minister should make a brief statement first. If the Prime Minister has made a statement, let him make the statement here in this House also. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We want to hear the Prime Minister, not these minions. (*Interruptions*) Let the Prime Minister make a statement here and let there be a debate.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Government come forward. (*Interruptions*) I agree. I will listen to you. Let the Government come forward and let us decide the time when we want to discuss it.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASAMY: If the Prime Minister has made the statement, let him repeat it here also.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, I have already placed.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let the Prime Minister make the Statement here. (*Interruptions*) No, they cannot have their way. Let the Prime Minister make the statement.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA The Prime Minister runs away in every debate. He challenged V. P. Singh for a T.V. debate and then ran away. Now, he is again running away. (*Interruptions*) That is why I say... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: If the Prime Minister has made a charge against us we are also are making a charge against the Prime Minister. He has to make a statement here not the Home Minister. Who is he to make the statement? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I have made my offer. We are prepared to discuss. I and the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs are prepared to settle the pattern. I accept the offer Dipen Ghosh has made. The Government is willing to come forward. Let this House discuss and find who is the traitor in this House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: There should be a discussion. The Prime Minister must make a statement here.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT): Madam Deputy Chairman, in view of the seriousness of the matter, I prefer that the Home Minister should make a statement on subversion and separatism today itself in the afternoon. Let us have a discussion. ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You had had... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Today itself he should make a statement.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let the Prime Minister make a statement. We can have a discussion.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Anyone who talks for separatism or subversion is a traitor. What the Prime Minister has said, let us have a discussion on separatism and subversinon today itself. Be brave enough to accept the Home Minister's offer.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam Deputy Chairman, I would beg of you not to allow this matter to be defused. It is not a general debate on subversion that we want. We are not demanding a general debate on secession. It is a very specific point that the Prime Minister has alleged that traitors have reached Parliament House... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradesh)... (*Interruptions*)...There are also traitors... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam Deputy Chairman, let me complete. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You don't allow the Minister to speak and how can I ask anybody to sit down. ..(*Interruptions*)... Just a minute. Nobody unfortunately or lately is listening to the Chair, right, left and front. When the Minister was giving his reaction, none of you allowed him to speak. ...(*Interruptions*)...Just look at your Members, Mr Advani. It is not nice to throw stones when you are sitting in a glass house. I was listening very patiently when the Members from the Opposition raised some objections on the Prime Minister's Speech. Somebody from the Government has to come and reply to it ...(*Interruptions*)... Please just keep quiet.

SHRI PUTTAPAGA RADHAKRISHNA: Why not the Pirme Minister himself reply to it?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am very sorry. The whole world is watching you as to how you are be-

[The Deputy Chairman]

having. Let me make my observations. You have been in the Government and you know that somebody has to come forward. The Minister for Parliamentary Affairs or the Home Minister has to come forward and you can decide when and how to discuss it but there is nothing to shout people down.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): Discuss on what?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whatever they want to discuss that will be discussed. Everything will be discussed.

SHRI T. R. BALU (Tamil Nadu): The Government has to apologise.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Why are you afraid of discussing? If we discuss separatism and subversion, then, everybody will be exposed. Anyone who talks about subversion and separatsim is a tratitor whether he is a Member of Parliament or not. Let us discuss about it today itself.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let the Prime Minister come.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, ...(*Interruptions*)..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You decide among yourselves who is your spokesman. All right ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: (Uttar Pradesh) If we are going to have a discussion, are you also going to discuss who did what in 1942... (*Interruptions*)...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes yes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After Mr. Advani speaks I would like the Government to react...(*Interruptions*) ...No. you all decided that Mr. Advani will speak. Let Mr. Advani speak and let the Government react. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : वाजपेयी जी के बारे में बतायें कि 1942 में उन्होंने क्या किया ... (**व्यवधान**) हजारों स्वतंत्रता सेनानियों को जेल भिजवाया ब्रिटिश साम्राज्य का पिट्ठू बनकर ... (**व्यवधान**)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will request the hon. Members... (*Interruptions*)...Mr. Ahluwalia, please sit down. When we have a discussion, you can speak about this. Now, you sit down. I want a promise from the hon. Members. When Advani Ji is speaking, let him speak. When somebody is speaking from the Government you would not interrupt him. Otherwise, I would close the matter. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam Deputy Chairman, this issue has arisen out of the Prime Minister's speech yesterday. There was a lot of criticism of various sections of Opposition parties in different ways...(*Interruptions*)...

उपसभापति : पंडित जी, मेरी आपने क्लिंग नहीं सुनी, शायद, आप बाहर थे । जब ये बोलेंगे तो कोई डिस्टर्ब नहीं करेगा और जब गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से कोई बोलेगा तो आप डिस्टर्ब नहीं करेंगे।

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: But the specific point which really agitated the Members of this side in the House was the reference to the fact that traitors have managed to reach even Parliament House. Now, we are not discussing generally subversion, secession and treason in the country. There is a lot of it and if there is a discussion on that, I would also have to say a lot. But a specific remark has been made about Parliament and if there is really any Member, who according to the knowledge of the Government, is acting contrary to national interest and betraying the country, then it does not call for a discussion. It calls for action against the Member...(*Interruptions*)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): I only wanted... (*Interduptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: There is no point of order. We will not hear him. ... (*Interruptions*) ...He is breaking the rules... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't take the powed of the Chair. You can go through me. I am still available. I am still sitting in the Chair and listening. So, don't take upon youself.. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I only wanted to ask a clarification from Advani Ji .... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): They first ask for a discussion... (*Interruption*)...

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I only wanted to ask a clarification from Advani Ji on a point he made.... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Why are you afraid of this discussion today itself? Let us have a discussion today itself... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam, if I was in the Government and I had information about this—mention has been made of Mr. Ram Jethmalani very specifically from this side—I would immediately move a motion of privilege and see that he is disqualified. Everyone knows this side that I do not agree with Jethmalani's assessment of the Punjab situation. He was a colleague of mine... (*Interruptions*)...

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आप प्रस्ताव करिए ... (व्यवधान) इनको इस सदन से निकाला जाये... (व्यवधान) सदन से निकाला जाए राम जेठमलानी को ... (व्यवधान) अगर वे राष्ट्रीय नहीं है तो विरोधी दल के नेता के रूप में आप घोषणा करिए कि उसको निकाला जाए... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: As the Chair made some submission, I hope the Members will abide by it. Don't get agitated. If the matter is so serious, let us discuss it in a peaceful manner. (व्यवधान) कृपया आप अभी न रिएक्ट करें। गवर्नमेंट को रिएक्ट करने दीजिए ।

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: An impression is sought to be created that the remarks made by the P.M. yesterday were principally because of him. This is the impression sought to be created by the ruling party. What I would like to say,, Madam,... (*Interruptions*)... Madam Deputy Chairman, I have known Mr. Jethmalani from very close. He has been a personal colleague in my party and my friend. And I would say, even though I strongly differ with his assessment of Punjab, that he is a patriot whose patriotism cannot be questioned, that he is entirely opposed to Khalistan, he is strongly opposed to secession. And in pite of it, a slanderous campaign is going on all through the country which acquires even the support of the Prime Minister... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give you a chance after he finishes. I will give yo ua change. No. I won't permit you. I have given a word, please. I won't allow you now. I would allow the Home Minister and the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to react.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam Deputy Cairman I regard it as unfortunate that even in his absence all kinds of allegations, insinuations, are being made against him. If there is any iota of proof with the Government, let a motion be moved to remove him from the House rather than this kind of a slanderous cam-

[Shri Lal K. Advani]

paign being launched against him. Therefore, Madam, my submission is that the speech by the P.M. made yesterday was intemperate irresponsible and slanderous and therefore... (*Interruptions*)... if at all there has to be a discussion in the House, it has not to be on subversion, it has got to be on that speech I am willing to discuss that.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, I have listened with patience to what Shri Advaniji has spoken obviously on behalf of the Opposition. But I found that he was speaking only on behalf of the BJP and not on behalf of the Opposition because...(*Interruptions*)...Now, listen.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have given me word that you will not make noise. Please abide by your promise. (*Interruptions*). No, No, You cannot make the Home Minister speak what you want him to speak. He will speak like Advaniji spoke what he wanted to speak. Please do not make noise. I will not allow. (*Interruptions*)... Please sit down.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: If he had taken into consideration the stand which has been publicly taken by some of the very important leaders of the Opposition outside and inside, he would not have given that certificate of patriotism to anybody, much less to Mr. Jethmalani. Therefore, I dare say that Mr. Advani has spoken on behalf of the BJP and not on behalf of the entire Opposition. ...(*Interruptions*).... Yes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Professor Saheb, are you not sitting in this House? (*Interruptions*). I won't allow. Anybody who speaks without my permission wil not go on record. I am allowing you.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal)*

*Not recorded.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Does it mean Mr. Advani did not speak on behalf of anybody? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I will prove it when the discussion takes place. In this august House I will prove what Mr. Jethmalani has done outside India. I am sory, he has mentioned his name now. So I have to take his name now. Otherwise I would not have taken his name. He has taken pride in saying that what the BJP and the Shiv Sena...(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jusa a minute. Please do not disturb him.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I will place before this august House documentary proof on which it has been established that he is not only an office-bearer of the Janata Dal but he continues to have a deep link with the BJP because what he has spoken outside India is nothing else. (*Interruptions*). Coming to the other point,... (*Interruptioss*)...Shri Advaniji has sought towards the end of his observations what the Prime Minister had highlighted. The nation is grateful to the honourable Prime Minister for hghlighting the dangers that are posed to the unity and integrity of this country by the sepadatists, by the obscurantists, by the subversive and feudal forces, working in the name of religion in this country. He has exposed such forces and the whole country is bebolden to him, the country is greatful to the Prime Minister for highlighting that reactionary forces are trying to destabilise this country. Therefore, all that the Prime Minisied said in his speech from the Red Fort on these very vital aspects of our national life, on the serious dangers that these elements or forces are today posing to the national integration, the unity and sovereignity of he country, is the subject-matter of discusion in this House. During the course of this

discussion I will place before this House the facts relating to those traitors who have managed to enter into this House. I don't run away and I accept the offer made by Shri Dipen Ghosh and the Government is willing to come to thisc House. Let this House discuss and let it come to a conclusion, let Shri Vajpayeeji or Shri Advaniji come to a conclusion, that a traitor has entered this House. And this house will be free to take action and we wil take any action proposed by Shri Advaniji against such elements which have entered this House having treason in mind and propagating against the national unity and integrity of India outside.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I seriously object to this kind of a charge... (*Interruption*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is everybody agreed?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Agreed for what?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Agree to discuss...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: No, no. I just want to meet his points...

श्री रामनरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदया, ये पहले यह बता दें कि क्या जो माननीय गृह मंत्री जी ने कहा है, उस बात को मानने के लिए तैयार हैं ?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We are not running away from a discussion. Let me make it very clear. But what do you want to discuss? You are well aware...

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: The discussion must take place today. Mr. Advani will have a chance to defend anybody and let Mr Buta Singh place before the House whatever facts he has. Even if he is a Member of Parliament, if he is doing anything, subversive to the country, it must be discussed ... (*Interruption*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, I am not yielding. Let me make my point let me say what we have to say. It was the Opposition which had raised the issue of the speech made by the Prime Minister yesterday. It was again the Opposition which drew the attention of the House to the particular charges made by the Prime Minister yesterday against the Opposition and also in particular against some Membods who have, according to him, entered Parliament. And we also demanded from the Prime Minister that he should explain his stand why he made that statement. (*Interruption*) We sand by that. Let me put on record. The Opposition demanded that the Prime Minister should come over here and make a statement explaining what made him level such charges against the Opposition and also against Members who, according to him, are traitors. So, we stand by that. The Prime-Minister should come here and make a statement ... (*Interruptions*) ... Please, please Let me finish... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: The responsibility is not on the part of the Prime Minister alone. The reponsibility comes on the whole Cabinet. You cannot... (*Interruptions*) ...demand that the Prime Minister must come here and must make a statement... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I have not yet finished... (*Interruptions*)...I have not yet finished... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: Madam, I am on a point of order... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We want to discuss the speech of the Prime Minister... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: I am on a point of order... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let me complete and you can have your say later...

[Shri M. S. Gurupadaswamy]

(*Interruptions*)... No, Madam, I have not completed... (*Interruptions*)... Let me complete and then he can have his say... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Gurupadaswamy. Let him say what he wants to say. He says he has a point of order. Let him say what he has to say... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let me complete; I have not finished yet... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Perhaps he wants to say something on what you are speaking... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: Madam Deputy Chairman, the demand that the Prime Minister should personally come here and...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: And apologise... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: ...explain is not relevant because whatever he spoke... (*Interruptions*)...he spoke in a public meeting and not here in this House. He did not speak in this House... (*Interruptions*)... He spoke in a public meeting and not in this House... (*Interruptions*)...It was not in this House... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): There is no point of order... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: There is no point of order in this... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: There is no point of order in this... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: The Prime Minister addressed the nation and not the Rajya Sabha... (*Interruptions*)... and, therefore, they cannot demand that he should explain his conduct here... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI D. B. CHANDRE GOWDA (Karnataka): The Prime Minister is addressing the nation in a public meeting? He has stopped down to that level?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He has made a referenc to the Members... (*Interruptions*)...He has made a reference to Members of Parliament outside the House. Parliament is still sitting. He can make charges against any Member here, on the floor of this House. He can still make it. Apart from that Madam... (*Interruptions*)...he has declared, so to say, a war against the Opposition. Therefore, I suggested,, we suggested... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: He has spoken for the unity and integrity of the country... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Pedhaps he has made his last peech as Prime Minister!... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We suggested that the Prime Minister's speech should be discussed here and he must come over here. We are prepaded to discuss his speech and let him make a statement... (*Interruptions*)...Let him make a statement, let him make his position clear before us... (*Interruptions*)... If there is any charge against any particular Member if they have got any proof or evidence, as my friend has said, let them prosecute him... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You won't do anything to him in your party?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If this is the attitude of those people, we know how to respond... (*Interruptions*)...We know how to respond ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, if the Home Minister has got any evidence.... (*Interruptions*)... any material against Mr. Ram Jeth-

malani, let the Prime Minister come here and Jethmalani can defend himself. Let him come here and explain his position. Then only we can have a discussion... (*Interruptions*)... If they have got any proof against Mr. Ram Jethmalani, let them prosecute him... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman,.. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, on a point of order... (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, is it your ruling that after every Member speaks, the Home Minister will get up and say something? What is it that we are discussing?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: In this country we are having parliamentary democracy... (*Interruptions*)...It is very easy for you to say all these things... (*Interruptions*)...

We are the biggest parliamentary democracy... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Why is the Prime Minister afraid of facing the House? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. (*Interruptions*) The Opposition Members made their point. The Home Minister reacted. I feel.... (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. (*Interruptions*) You do not know what is happening in the House.

SHRI PUTTAPAGA RADHAKRISHNA: I am aware of it. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I did not say that you are not here. I only said that you do not understand what is happening. (*Interruptions*) Everybody had asked Mr. Advani to be the spokesman. I... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: On a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What makes the Prime Minister fight shy of... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not think. (*Interruptions*) Have some patience. (*Interruptions*) Just cool off... (*Interruptions*)... Please.

The Government is coming forward to have the discussion. I do not think that the Prime Minister, if he can speak from the ramparts of the Red Fort, could be shy of the House. (*Interruptions*) I do not think. (*Interruptions*)

AN HON. MEMBER: You are defending the Prime Minister. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: There are forces... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me give my ruling. (*Interruptions*) You do not want to speak? I am not asking the Government to come forward... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Before you giving your ruling, I want to make a submission in response to an hon. leader of the Opposition, Gopalsamyji ... (*Interruptions*) Before you kindly give your ruling, I want to respond to what a leader of the Opposition said. Just one sentence response to what the leader of the Opposition said.

I want to make it very clear: Ours is the biggest thriving, functioning paliamentary democracy in the world. The Government can take action. Government will take action. But before that let that traitor element be exposed thoroughly in this House. (*Interruptions*) Let that traitor element be exposed in this House. Let the whole country once again know what the Prime Minister has said is borne out by facts, on the floor of this House. (*Interruptions*) By all means. We will take action. We will not spare anybody. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: The hon. Home Minister has expressed anger...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: No, no. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: The hon. Prime Minister yesterday, when he made his Independence Day speech, made a very irresponsible speech... (*Interruptions*)... as the Prime Minister of this country... (*Interruptions*)... an irresponsible and immature speech. The whole world is laughing on it. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please be serious. (*Interruptions*) How many times are you going to repeat this? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: If I have raised my voice, it is not out of anger. It was an attempt to make them listen to what I was saying.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I want to know what is the time for discussion. When will the Government make a statement?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I leave it to the Chair.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: There are forces which have encouraged separatism and all these things. Why not have a discussion and expose them? Have the courage to accept it. Why are you afraid of a discussion? I know that you are afraid because much more will be exposed. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam Deputy Chairman, you said that Mr. Advani would represent the point of view of the opposition. Mr. Advani has spoken and he has clearly stated the point of view of the opposition. Madam, he is no less a person than the Prime Minister or the Home Minister. He is not an ordinary member of the Congress Party who has said it. It is the Prime Minister of the country and the Home Minister of the country who are levelling charges of treason against a Member of this House. Now, the point which I want to make is that if they have the evidence which the Home Minister claims they have, then I would say that it is the most incompetent Government which has not taken action. It is incompetent. It is impotent. Otherwise, no Government would have sat on that kind of evidence. They would have brought a motion of expulsion against that Member who is sitting in this House. You are saying that you will like a discussion to take place in this House. We demand a discussion. The Home Minister is responding to that discussion. Now, there are only two points which I would like to make from our side. There must be a correct procedure which must be followed for such a discussion in this House. What exactly are we going to discuss? If the Government has the courage of its conviction, let them bring a motion of expulsion against Mr. Ram Jethmalani. The Prime Minister should be present in the House all the time.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: We can begin right now. We can skip the lunch hour and begin right now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we have to adjourn for lunch. Before that everybody has agreed that we are going to discuss the problem of subversion.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Only the Prime Minister.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Do you want to run away from the discussion? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Let me react to it. The Members do not want to discuss because... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We want to discuss the Prime Minister's statement.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Let the sense of the House be taken.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have understood. Just a minute, please.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I will just make a submission. The request was that the Prime Minister must appear and explain. This is what they want. Just a minute. The Home Minister has made the position clear. The entire Government stands by what the Prime Minister has said. This is what the Home Minister has said. Therefore, it is a question of a joint and several liability. And, therefore, when the Home Minister said, let there be a discussion on wht the Prime Minister said, this type of running away from the discussion is highly unexpected of the Opposition.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The Prime Minister should come. The Prime Minister must reiterate his remarks. On that we will have a discussion.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: There is no question of the Prime Minister coming. We will defend ourselves. (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STEEL AND MINES (SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR): What is the sense of the House? What does the House want?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I want to make a submission. Mr. Ram Jethmalani's name has been taken. (*Interruptions*) You please listen. (*Interruptions*) I do not want to remind Mr. Bhagat as to who was the person responsible for the Delhi riots after the assassination of Mrs. Indira Gandhi. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: 3,500 people were killed....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We are not discussing that.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Madam, is it not encouraging separatism.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am trying to give a test of patriotism to you.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: We do not want it. You give it to Mr. Advani.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, what I wanted to say is... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Take the sense of the House.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, the whole issue sprang up from the Prime Minister's statement made yesterday.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: We stand by what the Prime Minister said.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let the Prime Minister make the same statement here. And we shall take part in the discussion.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: That stand has been reiterated by the Home Minister. That statement has been reiterated by the Home Minister. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Why is the Prime Minister afraid of facing the House? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, Bhagatji. What I understand from the discussion form both the sides and what I feel from what Mr. Buta Singh has said and Mr. Bhagat has said is that when the Prime Minister made the statement yesterday...

AN HON. MEMBER: Broadcast.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me give my ruling. Please do not interrupt. He gave his speech looking at the overall situation in the country, and not one incident. So, let us discuss the overall situation. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The Prime Minister has to come over

here and make the same statement. And we will discuss that.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: They want to run away from the discussion. They are not prepared for a debate.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: How many times have we to say? Let the Prime Minister make the same statement here... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, let me assure this august House once for all that I swear that we will prove every word that the Prime Miinster has said.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We condemn every word he has said against us.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman, our Home Minister is so incompetent that he possesses the documents of treason but he is not taking any action against him. He is incapable of taking action. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: If the Home Minister has all the evidence and if he is keeping quiet, then he is the real traitor to the country. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Please it down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Did it not mean encouraging separatism?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the House so wants, I will take the sense of the House. Those in favour will say, yes, those against will say no. (*Interruptions*)...

The House is adjourned for lunch for one hour.

The House then adjourned for lunch at forty minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at forty-three minutes past two of the clock, **The Vice-Chairman (Shri Mirza Irshadbaig)** in the Chair.

RE: BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): I am on a point of order. It is about the business of the House only. There is a general convention that whenever constitutional amendments are discussed, the House is told when the Prime Minister or the Minister concerned would reply and when the voting takes place. Will the Government tell us when the Prime Minister will reply and when will the voting take place?

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Rajasthan): Even at the cost of repetition I would say—this is an important aspect—that we would like to be informed about it because in any constitutional amendment—and I have for the past decade now participated in many constitutional amendments—we are informed when the reply from the Treasury Benches will be and between what hour and what hour voting will be there. This enables the parties also to organise presence so that voting is proper. This is a limited aspect and we would like to be informed what is going to be today's schedule. Is it only up to 6 O'clock, because we in the opposition have not been consulted about the extension and we would like to know if it is for spilling over the debate to 18th, and we would like to know when the reply and the voting will be.

कृषि मंत्री (श्री भजन लाल): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आपने इसके लिए 16 घंटे का समय निर्धारित किया है और 16